

REMARKS/ARGUMENTS

Claims 1-6 and 10-31 are pending. Claims 7-9 are canceled. Claims 1, 6 and 10-13 are currently amended to remove “cyanoalkyl group” from the definition of R. No new matter has been entered.

With respect to the 35 U.S.C. §103(a) rejection in view of *Kitayama* and *Busman*, Applicants submit that these references do not render Applicants’ claims obvious. *Kitayama* teaches a filter having a layer containing a diimonium salt, wherein the diimonium cation must contain at least one cyano-substituted alkyl group (Abstract and [0008]). In contrast, Applicants’ claim 1, as amended, excludes the presence of a cyanoalkyl group in the cation of the diimonium salt. Therefore, the combination of *Kitayama* and *Busman* can not teach or suggest a diimonium salt that excludes cyanoalkyl groups when *Kitayama* expressly requires the presence of at least one cyanoalkyl group. Accordingly, *Kitayama* and *Busman* do not render obvious Applicants’ claims.

Furthermore, Applicants submit that there is no motivation to combine *Kitayama* and *Busman*. *Busman* teaches that associating highly fluorinated alkylsulfonylimide anions with cationic dyes improves their solubility in ketone solvents (Abstract and col. 1, lines 8-11). More specifically, *Busman* teaches that common anions such as SbF_6^- and ClO_4^- have minimal improvement in solubility of cations in less polar organic solvents such as methyl ethyl ketone (MEK) (col. 1, lines 36-64) and that replacing those common anions with highly fluorinated alkylsulfonylimide anions improves the solubility in MEK (Examples 1-8). However, Applicants submit that the cation of the diimonium salt, even in combination with a common anion such as SbF_6^- or ClO_4^- , already has sufficient solubility in MEK and similar solvents that there would be no need or motivation to replace the anions of *Kitayama* with the anions of *Busman* to improve solubility. Applicants have conducted an experiment to measure the solubility of the cation of the diimonium salt with each of the SbF_6^- and ClO_4^-

anions.¹ The results of the experiment show that the cation of the diimonium salt has a solubility of 45.3mg/g of MEK with the ClO₄⁻ anion and 134mg/g of MEK with the SbF₆⁻ anion. Both of these solubilities are well within the desired solubility range of *Busman*, “5-50 mg or more per gram of MEK” (col. 1, lines 53-55). Accordingly, as Applicants have suggested above, there would be no need or motivation to replace the anions of *Kitayama* with the anions of *Busman* to improve solubility.

With respect to the 35 U.S.C. §103(a) rejection in view of *Kitayama*, *Busman* and *Mihara*, Applicants submit that these references do not render Applicants’ claims obvious. As discussed above, the combination of *Kitayama* and *Busman* does not teach or suggest the claimed diimonium salt having no cyanoalkyl groups. Therefore, the combination of *Kitayama* and *Busman* with *Mihara* can not teach or suggest a diimonium salt with the absence of cyanoalkyl groups when *Kitayama* expressly requires the presence of at least one cyanoalkyl group. Moreover, since the anions taught by *Mihara* are metal complexes (Abstract and Claims) and are significantly different from the anions of *Kitayama* and *Busman*, one skilled in the art would find it difficult to combine these references. Accordingly, *Kitayama*, *Busman* and *Mihara* do not render obvious Applicants’ claims.

With respect to the 35 U.S.C. §103(a) rejection in view of *Kitayama*, *Busman* and *Koshar*, Applicants submit that these references do not render Applicants’ claims obvious. As discussed above, the combination of *Kitayama* and *Busman* does not teach or suggest the claimed diimonium salt having no cyanoalkyl groups. Therefore, the combination of *Kitayama* and *Busman* with *Koshar* can not teach or suggest a diimonium salt with the absence of cyanoalkyl groups when *Kitayama* expressly requires the presence of at least one cyanoalkyl group. Moreover, the compounds of *Kitayama* are IR absorbing dyes whereas the compounds of *Koshar* are used as catalysts in polymerization reactions or hardening reactions

¹ See forthcoming Declaration.

Application No. 10/535,671
Reply to Office Action of December 17, 2007

(Abstract and col. 6, lines 5-38). Therefore, *Kitayama* and *Koshar* exist in very different technical fields and one skilled in the art would lack the motivation to combine these references. Accordingly, *Kitayama*, *Busman* and *Mihara* do not render obvious Applicants' claims.

Applicants submit that all now-pending claims are in condition for allowance. Applicants respectfully request the withdrawal of the rejections and passage of this case to issue.

Respectfully submitted,

OBLON, SPIVAK, McCLELLAND,
MAIER & NEUSTADT, P.C.
Norman F. Oblon



Justine M. Wilbur
Attorney of Record
Registration No. 59,678

Customer Number

22850

Tel: (703) 413-3000
Fax: (703) 413 -2220
(OSMMN 08/07)